

# WEST VIRGINIA STATE TAX DEPARTMENT

## Administrative Notice 2003-09

---

**SUBJECT:**     **Property Tax** -- State Tax Commissioner's Statement Concerning Primary Reliance on the Market Comparable Approach for Appraising Reserve Other Natural Resources Pursuant to §110 CSR 1K-4.2.

On April 6, 1999, the State Tax Department filed Legislative Rule § 110 CSR 1K-1 et seq. (for the appraisal of natural resources other than coal, oil and natural gas). This notice will address this Rule's primary reliance on the market comparable approach to value when appraising reserve other natural resource properties for ad valorem property tax purposes.

### DISCUSSION

There are three (3) generally accepted approaches to value that must be considered when estimating market value of properties for ad valorem tax purposes. These are the cost, market, and income approaches to value. These approaches to value must be considered and should be developed, if appropriate, to properly estimate market value in compliance with generally accepted appraisal principles. The following is a brief discussion of these three (3) approaches to value and their potential use when estimating the market value of reserve natural resource properties other than coal and oil and gas for ad valorem tax purposes.

### COST APPROACH

The cost approach to value is based upon the assumption that the cost of a property, less depreciation (loss in value), yields a reasonable estimate of market value. There are three (3) generally accepted types of cost approach appraisal methods; these are: original cost less depreciation, reproduction cost less depreciation, and replacement cost less depreciation. Depreciation is a loss in value due to physical deterioration through use, functional obsolescence through design or utility and economic obsolescence due to outside market forces.

Original cost less depreciation is the cost of acquisition of a property less a loss in value due to physical deterioration, functional obsolescence and economic obsolescence. This approach is widely employed in the appraisal of "cost-based" regulated utilities, however it has a limited application when appraising reserve natural resource properties, as many of these types of properties were acquired years ago at substantially less than current market value.

Reproduction cost less depreciation is the cost of reproducing an exact replica of a property less physical deterioration, functional obsolescence, and economic obsolescence. This approach is employed in appraising one-of-a-kind properties such as works of art or special purpose properties, an example of which is the State's Capitol Building. Other mineral properties are a nonrenewable natural resource and can therefore not be reproduced. Because of their nonrenewable nature, reserve natural resource properties do not lend themselves to development of a reproduction cost less depreciation appraisal.

Replacement cost less depreciation is the cost of replacing a property with one of like utility less physical deterioration and economic obsolescence. This approach is the most widely used of the three (3) cost approaches to value and is widely employed in the appraisal of commercial and industrial personal property. Replacement cost has limited application, however, in the appraisal of nonrenewable natural resource properties, as the resource cannot, by its nature, be replaced. Because of their nonrenewable nature, reserve natural resource properties do not lend themselves to the development of replacement cost new less depreciation appraisals.

### INCOME APPROACH

The income approach to value is based upon the assumption that a property is worth the future income, discounted to present worth, that it will generate for a prospective buyer. The income approach is widely used in the valuation of various types of income producing properties; however, the approach has limited application in valuing properties that do not produce an income stream. Reserve other natural resource properties do not produce an income stream and do not therefore readily lend themselves to application of an income approach valuation.

### **MARKET APPROACH**

The market approach to value is based upon the assumption that the recent selling price of comparable properties, if properly analyzed and adjusted, will yield a reasonable estimate of current market value. Consistent with the above referenced Legislative Rule, the State Tax Department developed a market comparable approach for reserve other mineral properties. The Department has reviewed sales from 1989 through 2001 in various fashions and has constructed measures of central tendency concerning sales transacted during the aforementioned period of time. These sales have been analyzed according to methods established in § 110 CSR 1K-4.2 for reserve other natural resource properties. The Department published and filed final variables on August 30, 2002.

Reserve rates for the various other mined minerals are as follows:

Limestone	\$ 815/acre
Sandstone	\$ 1,750/acre
Clay/Shale	\$ 850/acre
Sand/Gravel	\$ 595/acre
Salt	\$ 1,140/acre

For more information concerning the appraisal of reserve other mineral properties consult § 110 CSR 1K-1 or contact the State Tax Department at telephone number (304) 558-3940.

Issued: January 27, 2003

Rebecca Melton Craig  
State Tax Commissioner  
West Virginia State Tax Department

State Tax Department  
Property Tax Division  
P.O. Box 2389  
Charleston, WV 25328-2389

Operator on duty 8:30 am - 5:00 pm  
Monday through Friday  
Phone: (304) 558-3940  
Fax: (304) 558-1843